

**MINUTES of MEETING of ARGYLL AND BUTE COUNCIL held in the COUNCIL CHAMBER, KILMORY,  
LOCHGILPHEAD  
on THURSDAY, 15 MARCH 2012**

**Present:**

Provost William Petrie (Chair)

Councillor Chalmers	Councillor McNaughton
Councillor Colville	Councillor McQueen
Councillor Dance	Councillor Marshall
Councillor Freeman	Councillor Morton
Councillor Glen-Lee	Councillor Mulvaney
Councillor Hay	Councillor Nisbet
Councillor Daniel Kelly	Councillor Philand
Councillor Kinniburgh	Councillor Robb
Councillor McCuish	Councillor Robertson
Councillor D MacIntyre	Councillor Scoullar
Councillor R Macintyre	Councillor Strong
Councillor Mackay	Councillor Walsh
Councillor MacMillan	

**Attending:**

Sally Loudon, Chief Executive  
Douglas Hendry, Executive Director of Customer Services  
Cleland Sneddon, Executive Director of Community Services  
Sandy Mactaggart, Executive Director of Development and Infrastructure  
Bruce West, Head of Strategic Finance  
Charles Reppke, Head of Governance and Law  
Fergus Murray, Development Policy Manager

The Provost referred to the sad passing of Councillor Al Reay who had died suddenly at his home on 25 February 2012. Members observed a minutes silence in his memory.

The Provost congratulated the Council's Web Team, IT and the many website authors and editors for all their hard work during the past year as the Council had been awarded a four star rating by Socitm for its website. In addition to the four star rating; Socitm had listed Argyll and Bute Council as one of the top 20 best developed websites in the UK out of the 433 reviewed.

The Provost advised that at the Royal Town Planning Institute Planning Awards Ceremony in London on 23 February 2012, Argyll and Bute Council had been announced as award winners for the "Rural Area and Natural Environment Category" for its Woodland and Forestry Strategy submission. This had been the first time the Council had received UK recognition for a Planning Award. Councillor Bruce Marshall, Spokesperson for Environment, presented the award to Fergus Murray and extended the Council's congratulations to him, and to Sybil Johnson; who had both been responsible for delivering this with other partner organisations.

Head of Governance and Law advised that in terms of Standing Order 14 the following Notice of Motion by Councillor George Freeman, seconded by Councillor James Robb had been received for consideration as a matter of urgency at this meeting –

"Argyll & Bute Council regrets the loss of the ferry services to and from Helensburgh. It also notes with extreme concern the current situation with regards to the renewal of the Gourock – Kilcreggan Ferry Service and the possibility that there could be a break in service between the current contract ending on 31 March 2012 and the new service commencing.

Given the impact that any break in this service would have on members of the public, Argyll & Bute Council agrees to raise this issue as a matter of urgency with SPT so as to seek an

assurance that they have plans in place that will ensure that there will be no break in service between the current contract ending and the new contract starting even if this means SPT agreeing to extend the current contract.

The Council also agrees to pursue the re-instatement of a Helensburgh ferry service with SPT. “

The provost ruled that he considered that the Motion was urgent due to the possibility that there may be a break in ferry services between the current arrangements ending on 31 March 2012 and a new service commencing on 1 April 2012. The Council agreed to consider the Motion and this is dealt with at item 4 of these Minutes.

## **1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Currie, Devon, Horn, Donald Kelly, MacAlister and Simon.

## **2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

None intimated.

## **3. MINUTES**

The Minutes of the meeting of Argyll and Bute Council held on 16 February 2012 were approved as a correct record.

## **4. NOTICE OF MOTION UNDER STANDING ORDER 14**

In terms of Standing Order 14 the following Notice of Motion had been received for consideration at this meeting.

### **Motion**

“Argyll & Bute Council regrets the loss of the ferry services to and from Helensburgh. It also notes with extreme concern the current situation with regards to the renewal of the Gourock – Kilcreggan Ferry Service and the possibility that there could be a break in service between the current contract ending on 31 March 2012 and the new service commencing.

Given the impact that any break in this service would have on members of the public, Argyll & Bute Council agrees to raise this issue as a matter of urgency with SPT so as to seek an assurance that they have plans in place that will ensure that there will be no break in service between the current contract ending and the new contract starting even if this means SPT agreeing to extend the current contract.

The Council also agrees to pursue the re-instatement of a Helensburgh ferry service with SPT. “

Moved Councillor Freeman, seconded Councillor Robb.

## **Decision**

The Motion was approved unanimously.

(Reference: Notice of Motion by Councillor Freeman, seconded by Councillor Robb, tabled)

## **5. TREASURY AND INVESTMENT STRATEGY 2012 - 13**

The Council considered a report which presented the Treasury Management Strategy Statement and Annual Investment Strategy. These strategies set out the strategy and investment products which would be used to manage the Council's treasury transactions for the forthcoming year. The Council also considered revised wording within the Treasury Management Policy Statement that had been the result of a revision within the Code of Practice on Treasury Management.

### **Decision**

1. Approved the Treasury Management Strategy Statement and Annual Investment Strategy.
2. Approved the revised Treasury Management Policy Statement.

(Reference: Report by Head of Strategic Finance dated March 2012, submitted)

Before consideration of the following item of business the Executive Director – Customer Services advised that pages 5 to 9 of Supplementary Pack 1, issued to Members on 12 March 2012, had been issued erroneously and would not be before the Council for consideration at this meeting.

## **6. ROADS RECONSTRUCTION CAPITAL PROGRAMME 2012/13**

The Council considered a recommendation from the Mid Argyll, Kintyre and Islands Area Committee held on 7 December 2011; that a paper be provided which detailed strengths and weaknesses of applying an asset-management based approach to the distribution of funding for capital roads projects. The Executive Director of Customer Services had submitted a report inviting Members to consider whether they would wish to receive such a paper.

### **Decision**

The Council agreed to take no action.

(Reference: Recommendation by Mid Argyll, Kintyre and the Islands Area Committee held on 7 December 2011, submitted and report by Executive Director – Customer Services dated 1 March 2012, submitted)

## **7. PRISON VISITING COMMITTEES**

A reports setting our requirements for the appointment of an elected member to a Prison Visiting Committee being formed for the new HM Prison Lowmoss, Bishopbriggs.

### **Decision**

Appointed Councillor Andrew Nisbet to represent Argyll and Bute Council on the HMP

Low Moss Visiting Committee.

(Reference: Report by Executive Director – Customer Services dated March 2012, submitted)

Councillor Alex MacNaughton left the meeting before consideration of the following item of business.

## 8. VALUE FOR MONEY

Councillor Semple had submitted a report raising concerns around the Council's approach to options appraisal in capital projects and value for money. Councillor Semple gave a presentation to the Council on his report.

The Council also considered a report by the Head of Strategic Finance in response to the issues raised by Councillor Semple and demonstrating that the Council's approach to options appraisal was in line with good practice guidance.

### Motion

1. To endorse the terms of the report by the Head of Strategic Finance.
2. To note that the Council has arrangements in place to secure compliance with good practice in options appraisal.

Moved Councillor Dick Walsh, seconded Councillor Morton.

### Amendment

- 1 Members instruct the Chief Executive to amend the Council's Capital Programme Planning and Management Guide to include the following –
  1. Where Members are asked to make a decision to commit resources in respect of a business case, they must have seen that business case and the business case must contain relevant comparable calculations in relation to value for money as part of an option appraisal.
  2. Option appraisals should separate value for money considerations from other appraisal criteria which forms part of the Council's business case methodology. Option appraisal of value for money should follow Green Book methodology particularly cost-benefit analysis.
- 2 All capital projects which are not under contractual agreement from today should be subject to a cost benefit analysis and the results reported to members so that they can be assured worthwhile benefits will be released.

Moved Councillor Semple, seconded Councillor R Macintyre.

The requisite number of Members present required the vote to be taken by calling the roll and Members voted as follows –

### Motion

Councillor Colville  
Councillor Dance  
Councillor Hay  
Councillor Daniel Kelly  
Councillor Kinniburgh

### Amendment

Councillor Chalmers  
Councillor Glen-Lee  
Councillor McCuish  
Councillor R Macintyre  
Councillor Philand

### No Vote

Councillor Freeman  
Councillor Robb

Councillor D MacIntyre  
Councillor MacKay  
Councillor MacMillan  
Councillor McQueen  
Councillor Marshall  
Councillor Morton  
Councillor Mulvaney  
Councillor Nisbet  
Councillor Petrie  
Councillor Robertson  
Councillor Scoullar  
Councillor Walsh

Councillor Semple  
Councillor Strong

### **Decision**

The Motion was carried by 17 votes to 7 and the Council resolved accordingly.

(Reference: Report by Councillor John Semple dated 21 February 2012, submitted and report by Head of Strategic Finance dated 9 March 2012, submitted; amendment submitted by Councillor Semple, seconded by Councillor R Macintyre, tabled)

## **9. INDEPENDENT REPRESENTATIVES: AUDIT COMMITTEE**

The Council considered a recommendation from the Executive held on 8 March 2012 to extend the term of office of the Chair of the current Audit Committee to 30 September 2012 to allow for continuity on the Committee post-election and to allow the new Council to consider whether to retain the Audit Committee's existing role.

### **Decision**

Agreed to extend the term of office of the current Chair of the Audit Committee to 30 September 2012.

(Reference: Extract from Executive held on 8 March 2012, tabled and report by Executive Director – Customer Services dated March 2012, submitted)

Councillors Mulvaney, Robb and MacMillan left the meeting.

## **10. NHS ANNUAL REPORT**

Dr Margaret Somerville, Director of Public Health – NHS Highland; presented the NHS Annual Report to the Council. Members were given the opportunity to ask Dr Somerville questions.

The Provost thanked Dr Somerville for her informative presentation.